Transforming Urban Transport – The Role of Political Leadership TUT-POL Sub-Saharan Africa

Final Report October 2019

Case Note: Lagos, Nigeria

Lead Author: Henna Mahmood



Harvard University Graduate School of Design

Acknowledgments

This research was conducted with the support of the Volvo Foundation for Research and Education.

> Principal Investigator: Diane Davis Senior Research Associate: Lily Song Research Coordinator: Devanne Brookins Research Assistants: Asad Jan, Stefano Trevisan, Henna Mahmood, Sarah Zou

LAGOS, NIGERIA

NIGERIA

Population: 203,452,505 (2018)

Population Growth Rate: 2.54% (2018)

Median Age: 18.3

GDP: USD\$1.121 trillion (2017 est.) **GDP Per Capita:** USD\$5,900 (2017 est.)

City of Intervention: Lagos

Urban Population: 50.3% of total population (2018) **Urbanization Rate:** 4.23% annual rate of change (2015-

2020 est.)

Land Area: 910,768 sq km

Total Roadways: 193,200 km (2014) **Paved Roadways:** 28,980 km (2014) **Unpaved Roadways:** 164,220 km (2014)

Source: CLA Factbook



I. POLITICS & GOVERNANCE

A. Multi-Scalar Governance

Nigeria's federation was restructured into 12 states in 1967, followed by the creation of Lagos State. In 1991, with the formal relocation of the seat of the Federal government to Abuja in 1991, Lagos ceased to be Nigeria's political capital.¹ The state of Lagos is broken down into five administrative divisions, collectively referred to as IBILE: Ikeja (the state capital), Badagry, Ikorodu, Lagos City, and Epe.² Lagos does not have a single, unified municipal government but instead features 20 local government areas.³ Since 2004, Lagos State has created 37 additional local governments that are considered illegal by the Federal government, which has decided to withhold allocations to Lagos State local councils.⁴ Such clashes between Lagos and the Federal government have been occurring since the 1960s and are further compounded by the fact that, under Nigeria's military-rule era constitution, many local responsibilities (e.g. policing, driver's licenses, etc.) are assigned to the federal government. Indeed, there have been clashes over transportation-related issues including road infrastructure and loans for the Lagos LRT.

¹ https://www.city-journal.org/html/lagos-nigeria-16011.html

² https://lagosstate.gov.ng/about-lagos/

³ Fourchard, Laurent. "Lagos, Koolhaas and Partisan Politics in Nigeria." *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, vol. 35, no. 1, 2010, pp. 40–56., doi:10.1111/j.1468-2427.2010.00938.x.

⁴ Ibid

B. Urban Policy

- Nigeria Vision 2020
- Nigeria Railway Authority Bill 2014
- Lagos State Development Plan, 2012-2025
- Lagos Non-Motorised Transport Policy 2018
- Lagos Strategic Transport Master Plan 2015
- Lagos Urban Transport Project 2002
- Lagos State Water Transport Program
- LAMATA Law 2002

The **Lagos State Development Plan** assumes Lagos will be ranked the third largest city in the world and therefore sets out a number of transportation and infrastructure-related policies which include an integrated transport system, traffic management and road safety plan.⁵ The plan will seek innovative ways to finance infrastructure including increasing user charges, rationalization of service levels and use of shared services, outsourcing, and strategic partnerships. It builds upon previous strategic plans such as the 2009 Strategic Management Framework, Vision 2020, 10-Point Agenda, Lagos State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy, and the Development Agenda for Western Nigeria.

The **Lagos Strategic Transport Master Plan** (along with the Lagos Urban Transport Project) introduces a fully integrated mass rapid transit system consisting of seven rail lines, one monorail, 14 BRT routes, 26 water routes, three cable cars, and road projects. In addition, it seeks to establish a common ticketing system to integrate public transport modes and develop waterways transport.

C. Climate Change/Sustainability

As outlined in the 2013 National Policy on Climate Change and Vision2020, Nigeria aims to pursue a low-carbon, high-growth economic development path and plans to build a climate-resilient society through the attainment of set targets, such as the use of renewable energy. Lagos is pursuing sustainable development and climate change adaptation through sustainable transport options (i.e. BRT, light rail, ferries), infrastructure investment (i.e. roads system)⁷ and partnering with institutions such as the African Development Bank in pursuing carbon credits.

II. INFRASTRUCTURE & TRANSPORT

A. Existing Infrastructure

According to the Lagos State Development Plan, metropolitan Lagos covers about 85 percent of the state's land area and encroaches upon non-urban land areas, some of it outside state boundaries.

https://www.scribd.com/document/271150413/LAGOS-STATE-DEVELOPMENT-PLAN-2012-2025

⁶ https://oxfordbusinessgroup.com/overview/taking-action-rehabilitating-and-expanding-transport-network-key-realising-its-potential

⁷ https://thecityfix.com/blog/future-sustainable-transport-lagos-nigeria-eko-rail-brt-cable-car-ferry-climate-kasope-aleshinloye/

Air/Rail/Ports: Nigeria has eight ports (Apapa in Lagos is the main port) and over 20 airports (Murtala Muhammad International Airport is the main airport). Nigeria is investing in a new international airport, new terminals at all four existing international airports, a port in Lekki, and three new deep-water ports with work started on the USD\$1.5 billion Badagry Deep Seaport, which is considered to be the largest deep-water port in Africa. Nigeria has also invested USD\$166 million to get older trains running again between Lagos and Kano, an ancient city 700 miles to the north. 9

Roads/Highways: Road network density is low – at 0.6 kilometers per 1,000 inhabitants – compared to the density of cars which is at 148 cars per 1,000 inhabitants. Apart from main highways, most roads are private-sector owned. The quality of many roads in Lagos are considered suspect or outright unsafe, particularly the Lagos-Badagry Expressway (the main East-West corridor in the city) and the Oshodi-Apapa Expressway.

B. Existing Transportation

Existing modes of transport consist of *molues* (buses), *danfos* (minibuses), bus rapid transit, taxis, motorcycles, *okadas* (tricycles), ferries and trains. Roughly 70 percent of motorized trips are made through paratransit and are split as follows: buses (82 percent), taxis and cars (13 percent), and motorcycles (5 percent). Among existing transportation challenges, Lagos is known for high levels of traffic congestion. Congestion typically follows a North-South pattern, since commuters to the Central Business District are traveling from the north and west regions of Lagos and alternative routes are constrained by coastal geography. Furthermore, cost recovery in the transport sector is low due to low user charges, inefficient collection systems, and poor management.

Danfo: There are approximately 75,000 minibuses known as *danfo*. Transport prices for *danfos* have historically accounted for 20 percent of a typical passenger's disposable income.¹³ The governor of Lagos announced plans to phase out the *danfo* and replace them with new commercial buses.

Molues: There are approximately 83,000 public buses known as *molues* (larger versions of *danfo*) operating in Lagos, accounting for 69 percent of motorized trips. ¹⁴ *Molues* are regulated by the Lagos Metropolitan Area Transport Authority and Lagos Bus Services Limited, which is the Lagos State government-owned asset management company.

Okadas: There are approximately eight million (shared) motorcycle taxis known as *okadas.*¹⁵ With their own union, ANACOWA, *okada* drivers filed a lawsuit against the Lagos State government in 2012 in response to the Road Traffic Law's restrictions on *okada* rides on 475 major routes.

⁸ Ibid

 $^{{}^9\}text{https://www.citylab.com/transportation/2015/02/how-overlooked-colonial-railways-could-revolutionize-transportation-in-africa/385056/}$

¹⁰http://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/25415/Lagos NMTPolicy.pdf?sequence=3&isAllowed=y

¹¹ http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/410431469427889576/pdf/103068-ppa-P074963-PUBLIC-IEG-rnigeria-0716.pdf

¹² Ibid

 $^{^{13}\,\}underline{\text{http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/410431469427889576/pdf/103068-ppa-P074963-PUBLIC-IEG-r-nigeria-0716.pdf}$

¹⁴ https://carnegieendowment.org/2015/01/12/governing-lagos-unlocking-politics-of-reform

¹⁵ https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/158562-nigeria-8-million-registered-okada-riders-association-president.html

Keke NAPEPs: These are tricycles carrying a maximum of four passengers with restricted routes in Lagos. Kekes are managed by the Tricycle Owners and Operators Association of Nigeria, which recently entered into an agreement with Mattatu, a keke-hailing app. 16

Ferries: The state and federal government provide ferry services, though there have been safety issues and shortage of investment with the Lagos Ferry Services Company. The ferry system currently carries about 18,000 passengers a day, but there is more potential since one-fifth of Lagos is water.¹⁷

Commuter Rail: The daily rail commuter service is operated by the National Railway Corporation and consists of an underutilized branch line.

C. Infrastructure Stakeholders

State Government: According to the Lagos State Development Plan, there is no up-to-date overarching transport policy that can help resolve fragmentation and duplication of institutional responsibilities. 18 Further, existing transport modes have built up powerful interest lobbies. To address these challenges, Lagos is interested in developing a new and integrated transport policy and master plan, fully autonomous public-private agency, safety and security standards, standardized transport systems, and appropriate mechanisms to ensure participation of transport stakeholders in state infrastructure planning.

Unions: Commercial drivers are affiliated with the Nigerian Union Road Transport Workers (NURTW), who include ticket operators known as agheros. NURTW is considered to be a highly politized and, at times violent union, 19 because they demand illegal taxes from transport workers and have been used by politicians to intimidate political opponents and, in several instances, to help rig elections.²⁰ Another dominant paratransit operator in the metropolis is the state chapter of the National Union of Road Transport Workers.

Ride-Hailing Services: Uber, Taxify, and Estonia-based Bolt are among over a dozen ride-hailing services available in Lagos. Despite facing tensions from drivers after slashing fares by 40 percent in 2016 and setting their commission at 25 percent, ²¹ Uber is now planning to launch Uber Boats services (following up on its launch in Cairo, Mumbai, and Croatia).²² Furthermore, Uber faces much competition from Taxify: more Uber Lagos drivers are joining the Taxify platform and are either on both platforms or have switched sides completely.

Existing motorcycle hailing apps include Max.ng and Gokada (each having over 1,000 drivers signed up). Gokada recently raised USD\$5.3 million in a Series A round of funding, just as Nigerian internet

¹⁶ https://www.konbini.com/ng/lifestyle/actual-uber-keke-startup-launched-nigeria/

¹⁷ https://thecityfix.com/blog/future-sustainable-transport-lagos-nigeria-eko-rail-brt-cable-car-ferry-climate-kasopealeshinlove/

¹⁸ https://www.scribd.com/document/271150413/LAGOS-STATE-DEVELOPMENT-PLAN-2012-2025

¹⁹ https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2016/feb/25/beatings-bribes-corruption-lagos-nigeria-traffic-jams

²⁰ Fourchard, Laurent. "Lagos, Koolhaas and Partisan Politics in Nigeria." International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, vol. 35, no. 1, 2010, pp. 40–56., doi:10.1111/j.1468-2427.2010.00938.x.

²¹https://qz.com/africa/986037/uber-and-its-rivals-are-struggling-to-keep-both-drivers-and-riders-happy-in-lagos/ ²²https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2019-06-27/uber-plans-to-launch-boat-taxis-in-nigeria-s-biggest-citylagos

company Opera launched Oride and SafeBoda announced an expansion to Nigeria.²³ In response to a 2012 ban restricting commercial motorcycles with less than 200-cylinder capacity (which applies to a majority of *okada* brands), Gokada and Max.ng have made attempts at maneuvering the ban but with limited success. For this reason, Gokada hired a former Lagos State Employment Trust Fund staffer as its first director of government and regulatory affairs.

D. Interventions/Projects

Lagos Urban Transport Project²⁴: A World Bank-funded initiative launched in 2002 and expanded in 2010 (LUTP2), the project introduced bus rapid transit (known as BRT-Lite because it does not apply all the "classical" features of a BRT, i.e. level loading and fancy stations) with goals to expand to other cities such as Kano, to construct pedestrian overpasses, to increase capacity support for the Lagos Metropolitan Transport Authority (LAMATA), and to expand a transport fund (which enabled LAMATA to meet 60 percent of its operational funding requirements).

Lagos Bus Reform Initiative: Lagos State government announced the launch of 5,000 new commercial buses to replace *danfo* buses.²⁵

Bus Rapid Transit (BRT Lite): Initiated and funded through the Lagos Urban Transport Project, BRT Lite runs 22 kilometers radially out of the Central Business District on Lagos Island (on a single route) and is operated by PRIMERO Transport Services (private-sector), Lagos Bus Services Limited (LAGBUS), and the First BRT Cooperative Society (composed of members of the National Union of Road Transport Workers operating on the BRT corridors). Since its implementation in 2008, the Lagos BRT has a daily ridership of 200,000 and captures 25 percent of commuters along the Mile 12-CMS corridor. However, most riders usually take other modes of public transport to reach BRT bus stops.

Interstate Bus Terminals Project: Lagos State government has enlisted the help of the Global Infrastructure Facility to test the feasibility of adding interstate bus terminals at gateway locations outside city limits.

Light Rail Transit: Lagos has developed plans for a rapid transit system (blue and red train lines) which they plan to finance through a Design, Build, Operate, and Transfer model. In this model, the Lagos State Government would "inject capital on building the tracks, bridges, and stations and the private sector can focus on rolling stock, depot equipment, communication, and control equipment." This model would be further extended to the development of water transport systems, roads, and highways. The light rail transit initiative also includes **Eko Rail**, which will operate on the blue line,

²³ https://qz.com/africa/1628649/lagos-motorcycle-startups-gokada-max-safeboda-fight-for-market/

²⁴http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/410431469427889576/pdf/103068-ppa-P074963-PUBLIC-IEG-rnigeria-0716.pdf

https://lagosstate.gov.ng/blog/2019/03/04/lagos-bus-reform-initiative-narrative/

²⁶https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/dsd/susdevtopics/sdt_pdfs/meetings2010/egm0310/presentation_O_rekoya.pdf

²⁷ http://unhabitat.org/the-state-of-african-cities-2014/

²⁸ Hoelzel, Fabienne. Urban Planning Processes in Lagos: Policies, Laws, Planning Instruments, Strategies and Actors of Urban Projects, Urban Development, and Urban Services in Africa's Largest City. Abuja: Heinrich Böll Stiftung Nigeria, 2018. Print.

will utilize through-tickets for buses, and is expected to have seven times as much carrying capacity as the BRT.²⁹

Cable Car Transit: The Lagos Cable Car project emerged from the Strategic Transport Master Plan and is planned for set up on the corridor linking Apapa with Lagos Island, Obalende/Ikoyi, and Victoria Island. It is expected reduce journey times up to 70 minutes each direction.³⁰

Eko Atlantic: Eko Atlantic is a new city planned for a peninsula (made of reclaimed land) on Victoria Island. The southern edge of the city will feature the "Great Wall of Lagos" that seeks to protect the coastline from erosion and the city from storms/rising sea levels. There are concerns that the wall will divert storm surges to lower-lying, more vulnerable areas of Lagos.

Lagos State Water Transport Program: The Lagos State master plan for transportation calls for the launch of 11 passenger ferry routes with services for commuters.

Truck Parking and Lagos Ports Access Facility: Lagos State government has enlisted the help of the Global Infrastructure Facility to test the feasibility of developing a satellite truck parking and holding facility, integrated with a wider port management system.

 $^{{}^{29} \}underline{\text{https://thecityfix.com/blog/future-sustainable-transport-lagos-nigeria-eko-rail-brt-cable-car-ferry-climate-kasopealeshinloye/}$

³⁰ https://www.trico-capital.com/projects/view/1/Lagos-Cable-Car-Transport-Project